

The Scottish-Canadian Community in Toronto: Class, Gender & Identity, 1871-1914
By Shannon O'Connor

I. Introduction

Surprisingly little work has been done on the Scottish immigrant community of Toronto and that groups' expressed identities during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries despite the existence of numerous Scottish ethnic associations and two Scottish-Canadian newspaper publications. In contrast, considerable attention has been given to the issue of identity among Toronto's other British ethnic immigrant groups, particularly the Irish.¹ Additionally, European immigrants and their changing identities in Canada have been the main focus of a number of studies.² The large majority of works written about Canada's Scottish immigrant groups, however, have centered on rural, rather than urban Scottish communities and around the debate over 'authentic' and constructed expressions of 'Scottishness,' - a term which will be here used to refer to demonstrable expressions of a Scottish identity or sentiment.³

An exception to the concentration on rural communities has been the recent work by Heather McNabb, Christine Bourbeau, and to a lesser degree Gillian Leitch, on the

¹ Brian P. Clarke, *Piety and Nationalism: Lay Voluntary Associations and the Creation of an Irish-Catholic Community in Toronto*, (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1993); Mark G. McGowan, *The Waning of the Green: Catholics, the Irish and Identity in Toronto, 1887-1922*, (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1999).

² See for example, John E. Zucchi, *Italians in Toronto: The Development of a National Identity, 1875-1835*, (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1988); and Carmela Patrias, *Patriots and Proletarians: Politicizing Hungarian Immigrants in Interwar Canada*, (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1994).

³ For more on debate over 'authentic' and constructed Scottish culture and identity see Margaret Bennett's *Oatmeal and the Catechism: Scottish Gaelic Settlers in Quebec*, (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1998); Norman MacDonald, "Putting on the Kilt: The Scottish stereotype and Ethnic community survival in Cape Breton," *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, XX, 3, (1988) : 132-146; and Ian McKay, "Tartanism Triumphant: The Construction of Scottishness in Nova Scotia, 1933-1954," *Acadiansis*, XXI, 2 (Spring 1992) : 5-47.

Montreal Scots.⁴ While limited to the early-nineteenth century, both McNabb and Leitch emphasize the way that certain prominent Scottish immigrants were able to extend power and influence over the urban community through their involvement in Scottish organizations, the most notable being the Montreal St. Andrew's Society.⁵ According to Leitch, this early-nineteenth century influence was expressed in strong British and Scottish identities.

The aim of this paper is to provide some preliminary insights into the nature of the Toronto Scottish community's identities as expressed through the city's various Scottish ethnic associations and the two principal Scottish-Canadian publications, the *Scottish Canadian* and the *Canada Scotsman*. As well, issues of class and gender difference will serve as a lens through which to analyze the Scottish-Canadian identities. The main focus, however, will be on the Scottish-born and the descendants of native Scots living in Toronto from approximately 1871, the year of the first national census and the first time ethnic 'origin' was a category of enumeration, up until the period before the First World War in 1914. First, this paper will briefly discuss the demographic and ideological character of Toronto's original Scottish community from the time of the city's incorporation in 1834 until 1871. Consideration will then be given to the various Scottish ethnic associations in Toronto in order to determine to what extent they served as

⁴ Heather McNabb, *Montreal's Scottish Community, 1835-65*, Unpublished M.A. Thesis, Concordia University, (Ottawa: National Library of Canada, 2000); Heather McNabb, "Butcher, Baker, Cabinetmaker? A View of Montreal's Scottish Immigrant Community from 1835 to 1865," in Peter E. Rider and Heather McNabb, Eds., *A Kingdom of the Mind: How the Scots Helped make Canada*, (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2006) : 242-259; Christine Bourbeau, (forthcoming) *The Scots in Quebec: A Study of the Perpetuation of the Scottish Culture in a Post-Migratory Urban Context*, Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation, (Aberdeen: University of Aberdeen, 2007); Gillian I. Leitch, "Scottish Identity and British Loyalty in Early-Nineteenth Century Montreal," in Peter E. Rider and Heather McNabb, Eds., *A Kingdom of the Mind: How the Scots Helped make Canada*, (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2006) : 211-226.

⁵ McNabb, *Montreal's Scottish Community, 1835-1865*, 71-72; Leitch, "Scottish Identity and British Loyalty in Early-Nineteenth Century Montreal," 211, 220-222.

exclusively elite and masculine domains. Lastly there will be an analysis of a selection of issues from the *Scottish Canadian* and the *Canada Scotsman* so as to discover how representative the views expressed in them were of the entire Scottish-Canadian community. The paper argues that the Scottish-Canadian community in Toronto during the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries tended to be exclusive and dominated by the male business and social elite; however, through the creation of alternative associations, and to a limited extent, through the pages of the national Scottish-Canadian newspapers, a wider cross-section of community members were able to participate and share in expressions of 'Scottish-Canadian' identities.

II. The Establishment of a Scottish Community in Toronto, 1834-1871

Immigration records provide evidence of a steady flow of Scottish immigration to Canada from as early as the late-eighteenth century up until the turn of the twentieth century, whereupon the number of Scottish immigrants coming to Canada increased dramatically.⁶ The increase in numbers can be attributed to a variety of factors, such as the more affordable cost of passage, poor economic conditions in Britain and the desire for British immigrants in Canada. Though no detailed or accurate records of Scottish immigration to Canada exist for the period before 1870, Table 1.1 shows that approximately 170,000 Scottish immigrants came to Canada in the years between 1815 and 1870.⁷ According to numbers collected for the 1871 Census of Canada and presented in Table 1.2, people of Scottish birth or origin constituted 20.3 per cent of the total population of Ontario.⁸ Furthermore, early provincial census data summarized in Table 1.3 illustrates that the proportion of people born in Scotland and living in Toronto ranged

⁶ J. M. Bumsted, *The Scots in Canada*, (Ottawa: Canadian Historical Association, 1982).

⁷ *Ibid*, 10.

⁸ *Ibid*, 10.

from as much as 38 per cent of the total city population in 1848, to as little as 7 per cent between 1852 and 1862.⁹ These numbers, however, do not take into account the percentage of the city's population who were among the second and third generation of Scottish born immigrants.

Overall, the Scots in Toronto were consistently among the largest three ethnic groups, second only to the English and Irish.¹⁰ In terms of real numbers, however, Table 1.4 demonstrates that by 1911 the Scottish born as a whole represented a larger proportion of the city population than even the Irish in early-twentieth century Toronto¹¹. It must be noted that these figures do not take into account those of Scottish origin, for which no consistent data exists for the years between 1871 and 1911. Nonetheless, there has thus been a significant Scottish community in Toronto ever since its earliest years as a city in Upper Canada and as a result of that presence there emerged changing expressions of Scottish-Canadian identities.

In the period between 1834 and 1871, the early inhabitants of York, later renamed Toronto in 1834, deeply identified with a "British sensibility."¹² The majority of these early settlers were either immigrants from various parts of the British Isles or United Empire Loyalists, many of whom had fought on the side of the British during the War of 1812.¹³ Despite their British sensibilities, however, such Torontonians still claimed individual 'national' identities, as can be seen by the formation of the Toronto St.

⁹ *Censuses of Canada, 1665 to 1871, Statistics of Canada, Volume IV*, [online electronic version], accessed 9 April 2007, <<http://www.statscan.ca>>.

¹⁰ William Jenkins, *Social and Geographical Mobility among the Irish in Canada and the United States: A Comparative Study of Toronto, Ontario, and Buffalo, New York, 1880-1920*, Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation, University of Toronto, (Ottawa: National Library of Canada, 2001), 42.

¹¹ Jenkins, *Social and Geographical Mobility among the Irish in Canada and the United States*, 42.

¹² William Jenkins, "Deconstructing Diasporas: Networks and Identities among the Irish in Buffalo and Toronto, 1870-1910," *Immigrants and Minorities*, Vol. 23, Nos. 2-3 (July-November 2005), 362.

¹³ Jenkins, "Deconstructing Diasporas," 362.

George's Society in 1834, the St. Patrick's Benevolent Society of Toronto in 1836 and the St. Andrew's Society also formed in 1836.

While the founding members of the St. Andrew's Society – men such as William Allan, Alexander Wood and William Proudfoot - obviously felt a strong connection with the country of their birth, they also identified with the British Empire through their membership in such associations as, the British American League, the British Constitutional Society and the Loyal and Patriotic Society of Upper Canada.¹⁴ In his article, "Scottishness and Britishness in Canada, 1790-1914," J. M. Bumsted argues that the competing Scottish and British identities during this period served to weaken immigrants' overall Scottish identity, particularly after Confederation in 1867 when a Canadian nationality became a third choice of identification.¹⁵ The problem with Bumsted's argument, however, is that it does not take into consideration the "multiple, relational, shifting, and contingent" nature of identities.¹⁶ Rather, Bumsted neglects the fact that, as Linda Colley states: "Identities are not like hats. Human beings can and do put several on at a time."¹⁷ In contrast to Bumsted, I argue that the existence of multiple identities was not mutually exclusive to a strong identification with Scotland. On the contrary, these multiple British, Scottish and Canadian identities were compatible and even complementary in many cases.

¹⁴ "William Allan," *Dictionary of Canadian Biography Online*, Ramsay Cook, Ed, 2000, University of Toronto, (9 April 2007), <<http://www.biographi.ca/EN/index.html>>; Edith G. Firth, "Alexander Wood," *Dictionary of Canadian Biography Online*, Ramsay Cook, Ed, 2000, University of Toronto, (9 April 2007), <<http://www.biographi.ca/EN/index.html>>.

¹⁵ J. M. Bumsted, "Scottishness and Britishness in Canada, 1790-1914," in Marjory Harper and Michael Vance, Eds., *Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory: Scotia and Nova Scotia, c1700-1990*, (Halifax, N.S.: Published for the Gorsebrook Research Institute for Atlantic Canada Studies by Fernwood Publishers, 1999), 100.

¹⁶ Ramsay Cook, "Identities are not like hats," *Canadian Historical Review*, 81, no. 2 (June 2000), 265.

¹⁷ Linda Colley, *Britons: forging the nation, 1707-1837*, (Pimlico, 2003), 6.

The most visible expressions of ‘Scottishness’ in Canada and especially Toronto, took the form of membership in the various Scottish associations, such as the St. Andrew’s Society, the Caledonian Society and the Sons of Scotland Benevolent Association, as well as through the publication of Scottish newspapers, namely the *Scottish Canadian* and the *Canada Scotsman*. Though most of the Scottish associations were formed around the 1870s or later, the St. Andrew’s Society dates back to 1836. Additionally, the Scottish newspapers did not appear until the turn of the century, when the number of Scottish migrants started to increase rapidly. Bumsted argues that these Scottish associations and newspapers can be seen as a sign of cultural decline, rather than strength.¹⁸ Nevertheless, the longevity of the St. Andrew’s Society and St. Andrew’s Day celebrations speak to the persistence of Scottish identities within Toronto and also provides an interesting contrast to the shorter-lived outlets of Scottish identity. Yet there is still the question of how inclusive these Scottish identities were and this issue will be the main concern of the following two sections.

III. Scottish Associations: An Elite and Masculine Domain?

The Toronto St. Andrew’s Society is one of the most popular and oldest Scottish associations in the city. Compared to many of the lesser-known Scottish associations that only survived for a few decades or less, the St. Andrew’s Society has been in existence since 1836 and its membership numbers remained consistently above 250 throughout the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, as can be seen by Table 2.1. Additionally, it was the only Scottish association until the mid-nineteenth century when several new associations formed, such as the Caledonian Society in 1869, the Sons of Scotland Benevolent Association in 1874, The Toronto Caithness Society in 1877, the Gaelic

¹⁸ Bumsted, “Scottishness and Britishness in Canada,” 97.

Society of Toronto in 1878 and the Scottish Lowland and Borderers' Association in the 1870s. By the turn of the century there were also two more associations: the Daughters of Scotland Association in 1903 and the Highland and Lowland Society in 1906. Unfortunately, few of these associations' records have survived from the nineteenth century, with the exception of the fairly extensive collection of St. Andrew's Society records at the City of Toronto Archives and the few constitution and membership lists from the Caledonian Society. Information about the Sons of Scotland Benevolent Association, on the other hand, is generally limited to the end of year financial reports printed in the *Scottish Canadian* and the Annual Report of the Registrar of Friendly Societies. Used in conjunction with Census records and city directories, membership lists from the St. Andrew's and Caledonian Societies provide a way to gain a greater understanding of the members' class composition.

The St. Andrew's and Caledonian Societies were largely led by men from among Toronto's social and business elite, which was fairly usual for nineteenth century voluntary associations.¹⁹ Men such as the Honorable George Brown, politician, owner of the *Globe*, and two-time President of the St. Andrew's Society from 1862-1864 and 1878-1879, were part of a wider middle class, from which the majority of the associations' members were drawn. These social and business 'elites' can be distinguished from the general middle class by the prominent positions they held within the community as politicians, judges, and wealthy merchants or businessmen.²⁰

¹⁹ R. J. Morris, "Urban Associations in England and Scotland, 1750-1914," in Graeme Morton and R. J. Morris Eds, *Civil Society, Associations, and Urban Places: Class, Nation, and Culture in Nineteenth Century Europe*, (Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2006), 139-141.

²⁰ St. Andrew's Society of Toronto, *One Hundred Years of History, 1836-1936; The Hundredth Annual Report From Nov. 30, 1935 to Nov. 30, 1936*, (Toronto: Murray Printing Co., 1936), 27, 105, 107.

Although theoretically open to anyone regardless of political or religious denomination, the one stipulation of membership was that applicants had to be “Scotchmen” or the “Children, Grand Children, and great-Grand Children, of Natives of Scotland.”²¹ Additionally, new members were required to pay an initiation fee, be nominated by two existing members and voted into the Society by no less than three quarters of its members. Such rules made it more than easy for membership to become the exclusive domain of the like-minded middle class. However, it is impossible to know for certain the extent to which the Scottish associations excluded the working-classes without a closer examination of the occupational range of their members.

Though records of Scottish association members’ occupations are relatively limited, it has been possible to trace the occupations of several of the St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society’s officers and committee members through record linkage. Using the 1871 and 1881 Canada censuses, city directories and society membership lists for the years 1869, 1871-1872 and 1895, I was able to create Table 2.2. This table illustrates the total number and percentage of St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society officers whose occupations fell under four general categories: artisans and skilled labourers; merchants and proprietors; clerks and professionals; and unskilled labourers. Not surprisingly there were no officers among the unskilled labourers category. Rather, the majority of the officers from each year were among the second and third categories, with occupations including merchants, businessmen, barristers, accountants, clergymen, physicians and clerks. The smallest number of members were consistently those of the artisan and skilled labourer category. While for the St. Andrew’s Society clerks and professionals increased

²¹ *Constitution of the St. Andrew’s Society of the City of Toronto and Home District of Upper Canada: with a list of its officers*, (Toronto, 1836), 5.

in number from 1871 to 1895. Due to the small number of occupations that were able to be traced for the Caledonian Society in 1895, it is difficult to discern any clear pattern of change. Nevertheless, the data do indicate there was also an increase among the number of officers who held clerical and professional occupations from 1869 to 1895. It must also be noted that the data gathered on the associations' officers and committee members provides no indication of the occupational structure of the general membership.²² Therefore, the degree to which skilled and unskilled labourers were involved in the St. Andrew's and Caledonian Societies is largely unknown.

Working-class Scots were more likely to be involved with the Sons of Scotland Benevolent Association, as that national organization not only provided an outlet for expressions of Scottishness, but also served an important social function to its members through the provision of mutual sick and funeral benefits – a service not provided to members of the St. Andrew's Society.²³ The constitution of the association was particularly attuned to working class pride in its emphasis on the fact that assistance would “render each member independent of charity.”²⁴ Yet despite the greater proclivity of working-class Scots to associate with the Sons of Scotland, the organization by no means comprised only working-class members. The Sons of Scotland Benevolent Association was actually very hierarchical, with individual branches, or “camps” being headed by a “Chief” and a small group of committee members.²⁵ Similar to the other

²² I am currently analyzing the occupational structure and diversity of the St. Andrew's Society general membership thanks largely to data collected from the St. Andrew's Society Roll of Members, 1886-1911, currently located at the City of Toronto Archives. This data will be made available upon the completion of my Major Research Paper, to be forthcoming in Spring 2008.

²³ Sons of Scotland, “By-Laws and Rules of Order of Inverness Camp, No. 54,” (Goderich, Ontario: s.n., 1893?), 5.

²⁴ Sons of Scotland Benevolent Association, “Constitution of the Grand and Subordinate Camps, 1915-1917,” in *Alexander Fraser Papers*, MU 1092, Archives of Ontario.

²⁵ Sons of Scotland, “By-Laws and Rules of Order,” 3.

Scottish associations, the officers and committee members were generally men of higher social standing within the community. Additionally, each local branch or “Subordinate Camp” was under the management of the main branch or “Grand Camp,” whose job it was to report on the activities of the individual camps and provide an end of the year accounting of expenditures and membership numbers.²⁶ These reports emphasized the fraternal nature of the association, with addresses to the “brethren” and references to a common “national and patriotic brotherhood.”²⁷ Therefore, while there was a certain degree of class difference among the memberships of the three main Scottish associations in Toronto, they did all have one thing in common; the majority of their office-bearers were generally from among the same affluent social class, with a high number of officers holding positions in more than one Scottish association.

As was typical of most ethnic and civic associations of the time, Scottish associations in the nineteenth century often provided limited opportunities for female participation. Women’s involvement in the St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Societies was restricted to attendance at the annual concerts, dinners, and balls.

Having very few chances to take an active part in the main Scottish associations in Toronto, Scottish-Canadian women had to find other avenues to expend their charitable efforts and express their own Scottish identity. By the later nineteenth century some women found outlets for their Scottish sentiments through their involvement in newly formed organizations such as the Scottish Lowland and Borderers’ Association. This organization, as well as the Highland and Lowland Society that formed later on in

²⁶ For an example of an end of year assessment notice see the February 1903 issue of the *Scottish Canadian*.

²⁷ Alexander Fraser, “Letter From Grand Chief,” *Scottish Canadian*, (February 1903), 23.

1906, welcomed both male and female members.²⁸ The Highland and Lowland Society even allowed women to serve as committee members.²⁹ Some Scottish women, however, were not satisfied with the limited roles open to women within the Scottish associations, as twenty-five of them set about organizing the Daughters of Scotland Association in January of 1903.³⁰ The aim of the Daughters of Scotland Association was similar to that of the St. Andrew's Society, insofar as its members desired to assist Scottish immigrants in the city. The main difference was that their focus was exclusively on the specific needs of female immigrants. Consequently, when faced with the choice of accepting a limited and marginal place within the mainstream Scottish associations, or participating in alternative non-Scottish associations, some Scottish women in Toronto found a way to express both their Scottish identities and their benevolence through their involvement with Scottish associations like the Daughters of Scotland. The lack of membership lists makes it difficult to determine how popular the association was, or which class of women were its predominant members.

IV. The Scottish Canadian Press, 1890-1913

Aside from membership in the various Scottish associations, Toronto Scots could express their Scottish-Canadian identities by reading or subscribing to either the *Scottish Canadian* or the *Canada Scotsman*. These two popular Scottish-Canadian newspapers were in circulation for a combined total of twenty-three years from 1890 to 1913 and served as the principal media for the dissemination of Scottishness amongst the papers' large reading audience. In *A Victorian Authority* Paul Rutherford argues that from 1871

²⁸ *The Canada Scotsman*, 1908, 10.

²⁹ *Ibid.*

³⁰ *Scottish Canadian*, January 1903.

to 1891 the newspaper and periodical industry in Ontario grew significantly, with the circulation numbers of all journals exceeding the total number of families recorded by the census in 1891.³¹ The wide readership and the high number of publications meant that people of every age, sex or class could find a paper to suit their tastes.³²

As can be seen from Table 3.1, the circulation numbers for the *Scottish Canadian* ranged from 2,500 in 1900 to as high as 5,000 in 1906, indicating an increasing level of readership. Yet the circulation numbers for the *Scottish Canadian* were never on the same level as some of the other ethnic newspapers published in Toronto, such as the *Irish Canadian*, which in 1891 had a circulation number of approximately 14,000.³³ The *Sons of England Record*, published by the Sons of England Society from circa 1896 to 1910 had an even higher circulation number of 19,750 in 1908.³⁴ Though significant, the circulation numbers of Toronto's ethnic newspapers were never on the same scale as the much larger, mainstream dailies such as the *Toronto Globe*, whose circulation numbers frequently exceeded 20,000 in the period from 1891 to 1908.³⁵ The circulation numbers, however, are only representative of the number of people who bought subscriptions and do not provide any indication of the actual number of people who might have read someone else's paper or bought individual copies. Besides the matter of audience, however, is the question of authorship. These papers can principally be seen as the expressions of their publishers' and editors' elite and masculine conception of Scottish-Canadian identities.

³¹ Paul Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority: the daily press in late nineteenth century Canada*, (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1982), 34-35.

³² Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority*, 34.

³³ *McKim's Directory of Canadian Publications*, (Montreal: A. McKim & Co., 1892), 119.

³⁴ *McKim's Directory of Canadian Publications*, (Montreal: A. McKim & Co., 1909), 92.

³⁵ *McKim's Directory of Canadian Publications*, (Montreal: A. McKim & Co., 1892; 1899; 1901; 1905; 1907; 1909).

The publishers, and in particular the editors, of the *Scottish Canadian* and the *Canada Scotsman* were able to influence the nature of Scottish identities in Canada to a certain extent through their editorials, as well as the papers' format and content. Established in 1890, the *Scottish Canadian* was published by the Imrie and Graham Publishing Company. While little is known about D. L. Graham, John Imrie was an influential poet and printer who had immigrated to Toronto from Scotland in 1871.³⁶ Imrie was also a life member of the St. Andrew's Society and the Caledonian Society until his death in 1902.³⁷ Though Imrie's poems were often printed within the *Scottish Canadian*, he left the general management of the paper up to its editor Alexander Fraser. Born in Inverness-shire Scotland, Fraser immigrated to Canada in 1886 and was the editor of several popular Toronto newspapers, such as the *Toronto Mail*, as well as the *Mail and Empire*.³⁸ He spent a great deal of his personal time, however, involved in the many aspects of Scottish-Canadian associational life. In addition to being the unpaid editor of the *Scottish Canadian* for the duration of the papers' publication, Fraser was also an active member and officer of the Burns' Literary Society, the St. Andrew's and Caledonian Societies, as well as the Grand Chief of the Sons of Scotland for twelve years and the President of the Gaelic Society of Toronto.³⁹ In contrast, comparatively little is known about John Cowan, aside from the fact that he was the original editor and publisher of the *Canada Scotsman* from its inception in 1908 until it was taken over by

³⁶ *Scottish Canadian*, January 1903, 12.

³⁷ *Ibid.*

³⁸ *Alexander Fraser Papers*, F 1015.

³⁹ *Ibid.*

the owner of *Toronto Saturday Night* in 1909.⁴⁰ The two Scottish-Canadian newspapers were ostensibly written in order to

supply the demand of a large number of Scotsmen and Scotswomen, many of whom ha[d] come to Canada within recent years...[and who] felt that a journal should be regularly published, whose interests would be devoted to Scottish life in Canada.⁴¹

Nevertheless, their editors were not against using the papers to express their own polemical views about the duties and responsibilities of Scots in Canada.

Both Alexander Fraser and John Cowan used their editorials to imbue readers with their own ideas about what the proper expressions of Scottish-Canadian identities should be. One of Fraser's most explicit editorials, "The Mission of the Scot in Canada," was a reprinted version of a speech he had made before the Caledonian Society of Montreal on 5 December 1902.⁴² Published in the January 1903 edition of the *Scottish Canadian*, Fraser expressed his concern that Scottish sentiment was "vanishing" among the younger generation and consequently he felt that there was "an urgent need...for a revival of Scottish sentiment in Canada."⁴³ Fraser's main concern was that Scottish sentiment was "vanishing" among the younger generation and consequently he felt there was "an urgent need...for a revival of Scottish sentiment in Canada."⁴⁴ For Fraser, it was the duty of the Scot in Canada "to infuse his character into the life of the people of Canada."⁴⁵ This, he believed, was principally to be undertaken through the work of the various Scottish associations.

⁴⁰ Duncan McLaren, *Ontario Ethno-cultural Newspapers, 1835-1972: an annotated checklist*, (Toronto: Toronto University Press, 1973), 140.

⁴¹ *Canada Scotsman*, 15 October 1908, 9.

⁴² Alexander Fraser, *The Mission of the Scot in Canada*, (Toronto: R. G. Mclean, 1903), 3.

⁴³ Fraser, *The Mission of the Scot*, 6.

⁴⁴ *Ibid*, 15-18.

⁴⁵ *Ibid*, 11.

In an editorial printed in the November 2nd, 1908 edition of the *Canada Scotsman*, John Cowan similarly wrote about what he considered to be the “Duty of Scotsmen in Canada.”⁴⁶ Just like Fraser, Cowan was worried about the younger generation of Canadian Scots and in particular, their disinterest in “the public life of the country.”⁴⁷ For Cowan, “it [was] the bounden duty...of every Scotsman who c[ame] to Canada to take an intelligent, active interest in not only her political but all her public life.”⁴⁸ What Fraser and Cowan both disregarded, however, is the younger generations’ prerogative to express their Scottish sentiments in their own way and not those that Fraser and Cowan proscribed as the most proper.

In addition to the proselytizing editorials, the form and content of the *Scottish Canadian* and the *Canada Scotsman* both reflected a strongly masculine orientation. In the *Canada Scotsman* none of the regular columns were directed towards a specifically female audience. In contrast, the *Scottish Canadian* had a column titled, “The Home Department,” which was a regular feature in the 1903 to 1905 editions.⁴⁹ The Home Department column offered advice on such as things as “Household” and “Health Hints,” which were particularly suited for women who would be interested in knowing how to “put a gloss on collars and cuffs,” or how to make Soda Scones.⁵⁰ There was also advice for “young brides” and on “amusements for children.”⁵¹ Yet despite its presence, the Home Department column was fairly generic and did not offer any particularly ‘Scottish’

⁴⁶ John Cowan, “Duty of Scotsmen in Canada,” *Canada Scotsman*, 2 November 1908.

⁴⁷ Cowan, “Duty of Scotsmen in Canada.”

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ *Scottish Canadian*, 1903-1905.

⁵⁰ *Scottish Canadian*, January 1903, 20-21.

⁵¹ Ibid, 21.

advice to women. The column could have easily been taken from any number of the other mainstream Toronto newspapers.

Aside from the occasional Home Department column, however, the overwhelming majority of the papers' content was concerned with news and stories that were either about Scottish men or written by them. Both the *Scottish Canadian* and the *Canada Scotsman* frequently contained stories that featured prominent Scottish-Canadian men. Men such as Alexander Muir, author of Canada's national anthem the "Maple Leaf Forever;" D. M. Robertson, Colonel of the 48th Highlanders; and General Hector Macdonald, were all featured prominently within the pages of the Scottish-Canadian papers.⁵² These men typically held important positions within the Canadian military, the church or politics and were represented as ideal Scottish-Canadians possessing qualities that were worthy of emulation. In contrast, there were almost no complementary female role models for women readers to look up to. The one exception to this general trend was the article printed in the May 1903 edition of the *Scottish Canadian* which centered on the New Lieutenant Governor of Ontario and, to a lesser degree, also his wife. While most of the article focuses on the Honorable William Mortimer Clark, his wife's picture is displayed in addition to his and the writer does mention that she is "a lady of great personal attraction, possessing qualities of dignified womanhood and tenderness, which has endeared her to all who have come within her genial influence."⁵³ Thus, when reading the *Scottish Canadian* or the *Canada Scotsman* women found very few local female figures with whom to identify and those that did appear were in no way ordinary Scottish-Canadian women.

⁵² *Canada Scotsman*, 15 October 1908, 2 November 1908; *Scottish Canadian*, April 1903.

⁵³ *Scottish Canadian*, May 1903, 139.

This is not to say that female readers could not identify with and relate to the prominent male figures celebrated by the papers. On the contrary women readers were all but inundated by national icons that were exclusively male. References to Robert Burns and Sir Walter Scott, the two most celebrated Scottish writers in the nineteenth century, were abundant throughout the two Scottish-Canadian papers. There is hardly an issue that does not refer in some way to either the works of these two writers or the men themselves. A “Burnsania” column, dedicated to different aspects about Robert Burns’s life or work, was a frequent feature in the *Scottish Canadian*.⁵⁴ Even the local Scottish-Canadian poets whose work was printed in the newspapers tended to be predominantly men. Though largely absent from the pages of the newspapers, eight female Scottish-Canadian poets were included in the Caledonian Society’s *Selections from Scottish Canadian poets*.⁵⁵ While the collection was dominated by men’s poetry, the inclusion of a significant selection of women’s writing makes it evident that men were not the only ones expressing Scottish-Canadian identities through songs and poetry.

The *Scottish Canadian* and the *Canada Scotsman* struggled to remain in circulation despite the fervent Scottish sentiments that Fraser and Cowan continued to expound throughout their papers’ pages. Few details about these two Toronto-based newspapers could be discovered; however, it was possible to discern something of their histories by tracing the evolution of the papers’ editions. Though the *Scottish Canadian* started out as a weekly periodical in 1890, by October of 1893 it merged with the *North American Scotsman*, a Chicago-based newspaper, and was published for three years as

⁵⁴ *Scottish Canadian*, January 1903; April 1903; August 1903.

⁵⁵ Caledonian Society of Toronto, *Selections from Scottish Canadian Poets: being a collection of the best poetry written by Scotsmen and their descendants in the Dominion of Canada*, (Toronto: Published under the auspices of the Caledonian Society of Toronto, 1900).

the *North American Scotsman and Scottish Canadian*.⁵⁶ Then when the *Scottish Canadian* returned as an independent publication in January of 1896 it took the form of a monthly magazine. The *Scottish Canadian* continued in its monthly format until its demise sometime in 1913.⁵⁷ The *Canada Scotsman* experienced an even shorter printing history than the *Scottish Canadian*. The first editions of the *Canada Scotsman* in 1908 were bi-monthly; however, in June 1909 it emerged as a monthly journal when publishing of the paper was taken over by *Toronto Saturday Night* with J. Ligertwood as its new editor.⁵⁸ The 30 November 1909 issue of the *Canada Scotsman* seems to have been its last edition.

Considering the Scottish-Canadian papers' had a relatively small circulation in a city with over 150 separate publications, it is not surprising that they would have struggled to compete with the bigger newspapers.⁵⁹ The short-lived existence of the *Scottish Canadian* and the *Canada Scotsman* can be taken as an indication that they did not reflect the views of the larger Scottish-Canadian community in Toronto. Rather, the Scottish-Canadian papers expressed the largely masculine and privileged views of their editors.

VI. Conclusion

This paper has attempted to determine the extent of class and gender differences within identities of the Toronto Scottish community during the period from 1871 to 1914. The various Scottish associations in Toronto and the two Scottish-Canadian newspapers

⁵⁶ McLaren, 139.

⁵⁷ Though editions of the *Scottish Canadian* only seem to exist until 1908, biographical information about Alexander Fraser lists him as being its editor until 1913; see the *Alexander Fraser Papers*, F 1015, Archives of Ontario; and Vance, 104.

⁵⁸ McLaren, 140.

⁵⁹ Rutherford, 3; Table 3.1.

served as the principal media for the expression of a Scottish identity. However, these expressions were by no means homogenous. Membership among Toronto's Scottish ethnic associations varied a great deal according to class and gender. The St. Andrew's and Caledonian Societies were largely comprised of upper-middle-class men whose occupations included that of merchants and businessmen to clerks and barristers. Virtually no working-class men served as officers or committee members within these two Scottish associations. The Sons of Scotland Benevolent Association, on the other hand, was more attractive to working class men, as that organization offered mutual benefits rather than charity and at the same time provided an outlet for expressions of Scottishness. Scottish women did not gain active membership within the Scottish associations until the early twentieth century with the formation of the Highland and Lowland Society and the Daughters of Scotland Association. Thus, Scottish associations in Toronto were predominantly an elite and masculine domain.

The other principal medium for expressing Scottish identities took the form of reading or subscribing to either of the two Scottish-Canadian newspapers that were printed in Toronto, namely the *Scottish Canadian* and the *Canada Scotsman*. Published for a combined total of twenty-three years from 1890 to 1913, the *Scottish Canadian* and the *Canada Scotsman* provided the most accessible means of identifying with Scottish ideals and sentiments. Yet the views expressed in the two papers were overwhelmingly those of their editors and almost exclusively masculine in form and content. Both Alexander Fraser, editor of the *Scottish Canadian* and John Cowan, editor of the *Canada Scotsman* utilized their privileged positions as the guiding voices behind the papers to imbue readers with their own conceptions of what the Scotsman's "duty" was to be in

Canada. Their ideals often completely disregarded the positions of the second generation of Scottish immigrants, who did not necessarily share the same strong identification with Scotland as the first generation. Additionally, apart from the occasional “Home Department” column in the *Scottish Canadian*, the Scottish-Canadian papers offered little in the way of items that were specifically directed towards a female audience. The regular content of the papers was almost exclusively written by men about Scottish-Canadian men. Unlike their male counterparts, female readers were not provided with strong Scottish-Canadian women who could serve as role models, despite the fact that such women did exist. Consequently, the Scottish-Canadian press was largely biased by elite, masculine expressions of Scottishness, even with its larger influence on the Scottish community in Toronto. Through the creation of, and participation in, their own Scottish associations, working-class men and women were able to assert their Scottish identities in spite of elite and masculine dominance within the mainstream Scottish associations and the Scottish-Canadian press in late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century Toronto.

Appendix A

Table 1.1 Scottish Immigration to Canada, 1815-1918

Years	Number of Immigrants
1815-1870	170,000
1870-1900	80,000
1900-1918	246,000

Source: Census of Canada, various years; J. M. Bumsted, *The Scots in Canada*, (Ottawa: Canadian Historical Association, 1982), 10.

Table 1.2 People of Scottish Birth or Origin in Ontario, 1871-1921

Year	Total Number of People of Scottish Birth or Origin in Ontario	% of the total Population
1871	328, 889	20.3
1881	379,003	19.6
1901	399,350	18.3
1921	465,400	15.8

Source: Census of Canada, various years; J. M. Bumsted, *The Scots in Canada*, (Ottawa: Canadian Historical Association, 1982), 10.

Table 1.3 Early Characteristics of the Population of Toronto, 1848-1861

	1848	1851-52	1861-62
City Population	23,503	30,775	44,821
Birthplace			
England	3,789	4,958	7,112
As a % of city total	16.0	16.0	16.0
Ireland	1,695	11,305	12,441
As a % of city total	7.0	37.0	28.0
Scotland	9,044	2,169	2,961
As a % of city total	38.0	7.0	7.0

Source: *Censuses of Canada, 1665 to 1871, Statistics of Canada, Volume IV*, [online electronic version], <<http://www.statscan.ca>> (9 April 2007).

Table 1.4 Characteristics of the Population of Toronto, 1871-1911

	1871	1881	1891	1901	1911
City Population	56,092	86,415	144,023	208,040	376,538
Birthplace					
England	11,089	14,674	22,801	24,901	71,116
As a % of city total	20.0	17.0	16.0	12.0	19.0
Ireland	10,336	10,781	13,252	11,804	15,964
As a % of city total	18.0	12.0	9.0	6.0	4.0
Scotland	3,263	4,431	6,347	6,464	19,787
As a % of city total	6.0	5.0	4.0	3.0	5.0

Source: Census of Canada, various years; William Jenkins, *Social and Geographical Mobility among the Irish in Canada and the United States: A Comparative Study of Toronto, Ontario, and Buffalo, New York, 1880-1920*, Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation, University of Toronto, (Ottawa: National Library of Canada, 2001), 42.

Note: The 1911 birthplace data are estimates. The census districts for which birthplace was reported include York South, 72% of whose population lies within the city of Toronto. Thus, Jenkins took the York South totals for each country of birth and multiplied them by 0.72 to provide the estimate.

Table 2.1 Membership in Toronto's Scottish Ethnic Associations, 1871-1914

	St. Andrew's Society	Caledonian Society	Sons of Scotland
Year			
1871	n/a	35	n/a
1895	320	523	n/a
1902	267	n/a	335
1914	512	n/a	409

Source: St. Andrew's Society of Toronto Annual Reports, various years; Caledonian Society of Toronto records; *Scottish Canadian*, January 1903; "Annual Report of the Registrar of Friendly Societies" *Sessional Papers*, Toronto, 1914.

Note: Membership totals for 1871 were not included in the annual report for that year, however, it was mentioned that there were 206 new membership applicants during 1871. Additionally, the membership numbers for the Caledonian Society in 1895 is an overestimate because it does not account for members who left the society or died in the years between 1869 and 1895. Also the Toronto figures for the Sons of Scotland Benevolent Association are an estimate based on numbers reported in the Ontario *Sessional Papers*. The national membership numbers of 6,088 for 1902 and 7,435 for 1914 were divided by 200 (the total number of camps in Canada) and then multiplied by 11 (the number of camps in Toronto) in order to provide an estimation of the membership numbers for Toronto alone.

Table 2.2 Occupations of Officers in Toronto's Scottish Associations, 1869-1895

	Year	St. Andrew's Society				Caledonian Society			
		1871	%	1895	%	1869	%	1895	%
Occupational category									
Artisans or skilled labourers		2	8.0	0	0	5	19.0	1	16.5
Merchants/proprietors		11	42.0	3	20.0	17	65.0	1	16.5
Clerks/professionals		12	46.0	12	80.0	7	27.0	4	67.0
Unskilled labourers		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Number of occupations traced		26		15		26		6	
Total number of officers		30		29		30		17	

Source: St. Andrew's Society of Toronto Annual Reports; Caledonian Society of Toronto records; *Censuses of Canada*, 1871 and 1881; *Toronto City Directory*, 1870, 1895.

Table 3.1 Circulation Numbers of the *Globe* and Four Ethnic Toronto Newspapers, 1891-1908

	<i>Scottish Canadian</i>	<i>Irish Canadian</i>	<i>Canada Scotsman</i>	<i>Sons of England Record</i>	<i>Globe</i>
Year					
1891	4,000	14,000	n/a	n/a	26,950
1898	3,000	n/a	n/a	n/a	34,805
1900	2,500	-----	n/a	-----	16,000
1906	5,000	n/a	n/a	-----	19,094
1908	-----	n/a	-----	19,750	29,882

Source: *McKim's Directory of Canadian Publications*, 1st – 6th eds. Montreal: A. McKim. 1892; 1899; 1901; 1905; 1907; 1909.

Note: The circulations numbers for the *Globe* refer to the weekly and not the daily edition.

Bibliography

Primary Sources:

Alexander Fraser Papers. F 1015. Archives of Ontario.

Caledonian Society of Toronto. *The Constitution and by-laws of the Caledonian Society of Toronto*. Toronto: Globe Print. Co., 1871.

———. *Constitution and by-laws, revised and adopted, July 9th, 1895, to which is appended a list of members, showing the year in which they joined*. Toronto: Imrie, Graham & Company, 1895.

———. *Selections from Scottish Canadian Poets: being a collection of the best poetry written by Scotsmen and their descendents in the Dominion of Canada*. Toronto: Published under the auspices of the Caledonian Society of Toronto, 1900.

Census of Canada, 1871, 1881.

Fraser, Alexander. *The Mission of the Scot in Canada*. Toronto: R. G. Mclean, 1903.

Irwin, W. H. and E. F. Owen. *Robertson & Cook's Toronto City Directory*. Toronto: s.n., 1870.

McKim's Directory of Canadian Publications. 1st – 6th eds. Montreal: A. McKim. 1892; 1899; 1901; 1905; 1907; 1909.

Newspapers:

The Canada Scotsman: a journal devoted to the interests of Scottish life in Canada. Toronto: John Cowan, 1908-1909.

The Scottish Canadian. Toronto: Imrie & Graham, 1890-1908/9.

Ontario Legislative Assembly. "Annual Report of the Registrar of Friendly Societies." *Sessional Papers of the Province of Ontario*. Toronto, 18??

Sons of Scotland. "By-Laws and Rules of Order of Inverness Camp, No. 54." Goderich, Ontario: s. n., 1893?.

St. Andrew's Society of the City of Montreal. *Annual Report of the St. Andrew's Society of Montreal*. Montreal: The Society, 1867-1868.

St. Andrew's Society of the City of Toronto and Home District of Upper Canada. *Constitution of the St. Andrew's Society of the City of Toronto and Home District of Upper Canada: with a list of its officers*. Toronto: s.n., 1836.

St. Andrew's Society of Toronto. *Annual Report of the St. Andrew's Society of Toronto*. Toronto: Globe Printing and Publishing Company, 1871-1913.

Secondary Sources:

Bourbeau, Christine. (forthcoming) *The Scots in Quebec: A Study of the Perpetuation of the Scottish Culture in a Post-Migratory Urban Context*. Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation. Aberdeen: University of Aberdeen, 2007.

Bumsted, J. M. *The Scots in Canada*. Ottawa: Canadian Historical Association, 1982.

Bumsted, J. M. "Scottishness and Britishness in Canada, 1790-1914." In Marjory Harper and Michael Vance, Eds. *Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory: Scotia and Nova Scotia, c1700-1990*. Halifax, N.S.: Published for the Gorsebrook Research Institute for Atlantic Canada Studies by Fernwood Publishers, 1999, 89-104.

Colley, Linda. *Britons: forging the nation, 1707-1837*. Pimlico, 2003.

Cook, Ramsay. "Identities are not like hats." *Canadian Historical Review*. Vol. 81, no. 2 (June 2000) : 260-265.

Firth, Edith G. "Alexander Wood." *Dictionary of Canadian Biography Online*. Ramsay Cook, Ed. 2000. University of Toronto. 9 April 2007.
<<http://www.biographi.ca/EN/index.html>>.

Jenkins, William Michael. *Social and Geographical Mobility among the Irish in Canada and the United States: A Comparative Study of Toronto, Ontario, and Buffalo, New York, 1880-1920*. Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation. University of Toronto. Ottawa: National Library of Canada, 2001.

———. "Deconstructing Diasporas: Networks and Identities among the Irish in Buffalo and Toronto, 1870-1910." *Immigrants and Minorities*. Vol. 23, Nos. 2-3 (July-November 2005) : 359-398.

Leitch, Gillian I. "Scottish Identity and British Loyalty in Early-Nineteenth Century Montreal." In Peter E. Rider and Heather McNabb eds. *A Kingdom of the Mind: How the Scots Helped make Canada*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2006, 211-226.

MacDonald, Norman. "Putting on the Kilt: The Scottish stereotype and Ethnic community survival in Cape Breton." *Canadian Ethnic Studies*. XX, 3, (1988) : 132-146.

MacNamara, Jane E. "The Records of the St. Andrew's Societies in Ontario: A forgotten source of family history." April 2006.

- McGowan, Mark G. *The Waning of the Green: Catholics, the Irish and Identity in Toronto, 1887-1922*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1999.
- McKay, Ian. "Tartanism Triumphant: The Construction of Scottishness in Nova Scotia, 1933-1954." *Acadiansis*. XXI, 2 (Spring 1992) : 5-47.
- McLaren, Duncan. *Ontario Ethno-cultural Newspapers, 1835-1972: an annotated checklist*. Toronto: Toronto University Press, 1973.
- McNabb, Heather. *Montreal's Scottish Community, 1835-65*. Unpublished M.A. Thesis. Concordia University, Ottawa: National Library of Canada, 2000.
- McNabb, Heather. "Butcher, Baker, Cabinetmaker? A View of Montreal's Scottish Immigrant Community from 1835 to 1865." In Peter E. Rider and Heather McNabb eds. *A Kingdom of the Mind: How the Scots Helped make Canada*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2006, 242-259.
- Morris, R. J. "Urban Associations in England and Scotland, 1750-1914: The Formation of the Middle Class or the Formation of a Civil Society." In Morton, Graeme and R. J. Morris et al. *Civil Society, Associations, and Urban Places: Class, Nation, and Culture in Nineteenth Century Europe*. Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2006, 139-157.
- Patrias, Carmela. *Patriots and Proletarians: Politicizing Hungarian Immigrants in Interwar Canada*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1994.
- Rutherford, Paul. *A Victorian Authority: the daily press in late nineteenth century Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1982.
- St. Andrew's Society of Toronto. *One Hundred Years of History, 1836-1936; The Hundredth Annual Report From Nov. 30, 1935 to Nov. 30, 1936*. Toronto: Murray Printing Co., 1936.
- Vance, Michael. "A Brief History of Organized Scottishness in Canada." In Celeste Ray, Ed. *The Transatlantic Scots*. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2005, 96-119.
- "William Allan." *Dictionary of Canadian Biography Online*. Ramsay Cook, Ed. 2000. University of Toronto. 9 April 2007. <<http://www.biographi.ca/EN/index.html>>.
- Zucchi, John E. *Italians in Toronto: Development of a National Identity, 1875-1935*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1988.